

MAT 449 : Problem Set 4

Due Thursday, October 11

Vector-valued integrals

Note : You are allowed to use without proof the following results :

- The Hahn-Banach theorem.
- The fact that every continuous linear functional on a Hilbert space V is of the form $\langle \cdot, v \rangle$, with $v \in V$.
- Hölder's inequality.
- The fact that, if (X, μ) is a measure space, and if $1 \leq p < +\infty$ and $1 < q \leq +\infty$ are such that $p^{-1} + q^{-1} = 1$, then the map $L^p(X, \mu) \rightarrow \text{Hom}(L^q(X, \mu), \mathbb{C})$, $f \mapsto (g \mapsto \int_X fg d\mu)$ is an isomorphism that preserves the norm (L^p norm on the left, operator norm on the right).¹

1. Let (X, μ) be a measure space and V be a Banach space. We write V^\vee for $\text{Hom}(V, \mathbb{C})$. We say that a function $f : X \rightarrow V$ is *weakly integrable* if, for every $T \in V^\vee$, the function $T \circ f : X \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$ is in $L^1(X, \mu)$. If f is weakly integrable and if there exists an element v of V such that $T(v) = \int_X T \circ f(x) d\mu(x)$ for every $T \in V^\vee$, we say that v is the *integral* of f on X and write $v = \int_X f(x) d\mu(x) = \int_X f d\mu$.
 - a) (1) Show that the integral of f is unique if it exists.
 - b) (2) Let W be another Banach space and $u \in \text{Hom}(V, W)$. If $f : X \rightarrow V$ is weakly integrable and has an integral v , show that $u \circ f : X \rightarrow W$ is weakly integrable and has an integral, which is equal to $u(v)$.
 - c) (1, extra credit) Give an example of a weakly integrable function that doesn't have an integral.

Solution.

- a) By the Hahn-Banach theorem, for every $v \in V$, there exists $T \in \text{Hom}(V, \mathbb{C})$ such that $T(v) = \|v\|$ and $\|T\|_{op} \leq 1$. In particular, an element v of V is zero if and only if $T(v) = 0$ for every $T \in \text{Hom}(V, \mathbb{C})$, or, in other words, two elements $v, w \in V$ are equal if and only if $T(v) = T(w)$ for every $T \in \text{Hom}(V, \mathbb{C})$. This implies that the integral of f is unique if it exists.

¹Technical note : This is not true in general for $p = 1, q = +\infty$ if μ is not σ -finite, but it can be salvaged for a regular Borel measure on a locally compact Hausdorff space by slightly modifying the definition of L^∞ . You can ignore this.

- b) We first show that $u \circ f$ is weakly integrable. Let $T \in \text{Hom}(W, \mathbb{C})$. Then $T \circ u \in \text{Hom}(V, \mathbb{C})$, so the function $T \circ u \circ f : X \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$ is integrable.

Now suppose that f has an integral v . Then, for every $T \in \text{Hom}(W, \mathbb{C})$, we have $T \circ \text{Hom}(V, \mathbb{C})$, so $\int_X T \circ u \circ f d\mu = T \circ u(v)$. This means that $u(v)$ is the integral of $u \circ f$.

- c) Let $X = \mathbb{N}$ with the counting measure μ , and

$$V = c_0(\mathbb{N}) := \{(x_n)_{n \geq 0} \in \mathbb{C}^{\mathbb{N}} \mid \lim_{n \rightarrow +\infty} x_n = 0\}.$$

We will use the fact that $\ell^1(\mathbb{N})$ is the continuous dual of $c_0(\mathbb{N})$, via the map $\ell^1(\mathbb{N}) \times c_0(\mathbb{N}) \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$, $((x_n), (y_n)) \mapsto \sum_{n \geq 0} x_n y_n$, and that the continuous dual of $\ell^1(\mathbb{N})$ is $\ell^\infty(\mathbb{N})$ (by a similar map). The map from $c_0(\mathbb{N})$ into its bidual is the usual embedding $c_0(\mathbb{N}) \subset \ell^\infty(\mathbb{N})$.

We define $f : X \rightarrow V$ by $f(n) = \mathbf{1}_{\{n\}}$. Then, for every $(x_n)_{n \geq 0} \in \ell^1(\mathbb{N})$, if $T : c_0(\mathbb{N}) \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$ is the corresponding linear functional, we have

$$\int_X T(f(x)) d\mu(x) = \sum_{n \geq 0} x_n,$$

which converges because $(x_n)_{n \geq 0}$ is in $\ell^1(\mathbb{N})$. Hence f is weakly integrable. But f does not have an integral (at least in $c_0(\mathbb{N})$), because the continuous linear functional it defines on $\ell^1(\mathbb{N})$ is representable by an element of $\ell^\infty(\mathbb{N})$ which is not in $c_0(\mathbb{N})$ (the constant sequence 1). As evaluating on points of $\ell^1(\mathbb{N})$ separates the elements of $\ell^\infty(\mathbb{N})$, there cannot be any element of $c_0(\mathbb{N})$ giving the same linear functional on $\ell^1(\mathbb{N})$.

□

2. In this problem, X is a locally compact Hausdorff space and μ is a regular Borel measure on X . Let V be a Banach space, and let $f : X \rightarrow V$ be a continuous function with compact support.

- a) (1) Show that f is weakly integrable.
 b) (1) If $\mu(\text{supp } f) = 0$, show that $\int_X f d\mu$ exists and is equal 0.

The goal if this problem is to show that:

- (i) f has an integral v ;
 (ii) $\|v\| \leq \int_X \|f(x)\| d\mu(x)$;
 (iii) if $\mu(\text{supp } f) \neq 0$, then $\mu(\text{supp } f)^{-1}v$ is in the closure of the convex hull of $f(X)$.

By question (b), we may (and will) assume that $\mu(\text{supp } f) \neq 0$.

- c) (1) Show that we may assume that $X = \text{supp } f$ (in particular, X is compact) and that $\mu(X) = 1$.

From now on, we assume that X is compact and that $\mu(X) = 1$.

- d) (2) Let $T_1, \dots, T_n : V \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ be bounded \mathbb{R} -linear functionals (we see V as a \mathbb{R} -vector space in the obvious way), and define $a_1, \dots, a_n \in \mathbb{R}$ by $a_i = \int_X T_i \circ f d\mu$. Show that (a_1, \dots, a_n) is in the convex hull of the compact subset $((T_1, \dots, T_n) \circ f)(X)$ of \mathbb{R}^n . (Hint : What happens if it is not ?)

Let K be the closure of the convex hull of $f(X)$. This is a compact subset of V by problem 6. For every finite subset Ω of $\text{Hom}_{\mathbb{R}}(V, \mathbb{R})$ (the space of bounded \mathbb{R} -linear functionals from V to \mathbb{R}), we denote by I_{Ω} the set of $v \in K$ such that, for every $T \in \Omega$, we have $T(v) = \int_X T \circ f d\mu$.

- e) (1) Show that I_{Ω} is compact for every $\Omega \subset \text{Hom}_{\mathbb{R}}(V, \mathbb{R})$.
- f) (1) Show that I_{Ω} is nonempty if Ω is finite.
- g) (1) Show that the integral of f exists and is in K .
- h) (2) Show that :

$$\left\| \int_X f d\mu \right\| \leq \int_X \|f(x)\| d\mu(x).$$

(Hint : Hahn-Banach.)

Solution.

- a) Let $T \in \text{Hom}(V, \mathbb{C})$. Then $T \circ f : X \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$ is a continuous, and its support is contained in $\text{supp}(f)$, hence compact. Hence $T \circ f$ is integrable.
- b) Suppose that $\mu(\text{supp } f) = 0$. If $T \in \text{Hom}(V, \mathbb{C})$, then $T \circ f : X \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$ is continuous and $\mu(\text{supp}(T \circ f)) = 0$, so $\int_X T \circ f d\mu = 0$. This shows that 0 is the integral of f .
- c) Suppose that we know the conclusion if $X = \text{supp } f$ and $\mu(X) = 1$. Let $f : X \rightarrow V$ be continuous with compact support. We have already seen that we may assume $\mu(\text{supp } f) \neq 0$, so let's do that. Let $X' = \text{supp } f$, and consider the measure μ' on X' that is $\mu(\text{supp } f)^{-1}$ times the restriction of μ . By our assumption, $\int_{X'} f|_{X'} d\mu'$ exists, let's call it v , we have $\|v\| \leq \int_{X'} \|f(x)\| d\mu'(x)$ and v is in the closure of the convex hull of $f(X')$.

Let's show that $w := \mu(\text{supp } f)v$ is the integral of f . Note that $\mu(\text{supp } f)^{-1}w$ is in the convex hull of $f(X') = f(X)$ and that

$$\|w\| \leq \mu(\text{supp } f) \int_{X'} |f(x')| d\mu'(x) = \int_X |f(x)| d\mu(x),$$

so this proves the conclusion for f .

Let $T \in \text{Hom}(V, \mathbb{C})$. Then $\text{supp}(T \circ f) \subset X'$, so

$$\int_X T \circ f(x) d\mu(x) = \mu(\text{supp } f) \int_{X'} T \circ f(x) d\mu'(x) = w.$$

So $w = \int_X f d\mu$.

- d) Let $L = ((T_1, \dots, T_n) \circ f)(X)$. Suppose that (a_1, \dots, a_n) is not in the convex hull of L . Then, by the hyperplane separation theorem, there exists a linear functional $\lambda : \mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ and $c > 0$ such that $\lambda(a_1, \dots, a_n) \geq c + \lambda(v)$, for every $v \in L$. Let $\lambda_1, \dots, \lambda_n \in \mathbb{R}$ be the images by λ of the vectors of the canonical basis of \mathbb{R}^n . Then we have, for every $x \in X$,

$$\sum_{i=1}^n \lambda_i a_i = \lambda(a_1, \dots, a_n) \geq c + \lambda \circ (T_1, \dots, T_n) \circ f(x) = c + \sum_{i=1}^n \lambda_i T_i(f(x)).$$

Taking the integral over X (and using $\mu(X) = 1$) gives

$$\sum_{i=1}^n \lambda_i a_i \geq c + \sum_{i=1}^n \lambda_i \int_X T_i \circ f(x) d\mu(x) = c + \sum_{i=1}^n \lambda_i a_i,$$

a contradiction.

- e) For every $T \in \text{Hom}_{\mathbb{R}}(V, \mathbb{R})$, the set of $v \in K$ such that $T(v) = \int_X T \circ f d\mu$ is a closed subset of K . As the set I_{Ω} is an intersection of sets of this form, it is also a closed subset of K , hence compact because K is compact.
- f) If Ω is finite, write $\Omega = \{T_1, \dots, T_n\}$ and $T_{\Omega} = (T_1, \dots, T_n) : V \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^n$. We have seen in question (d) that $a := \int_X T_{\Omega}(f(x))d\mu(x)$ is in the convex hull of $T_{\Omega}(f(X))$, so there exists $v \in V$ such that v is in the convex hull of $f(X)$ (hence in K) and $T_{\Omega}(v) = a = \int_V T_{\Omega}(f(x))d\mu(x)$. The second condition says exactly that $v \in I_{\Omega}$.
- g) The subsets $(I_{\{T\}})_{T \in \text{Hom}_{\mathbb{R}}(V, \mathbb{R})}$ of K have the finite intersection property by question (f). As K is compact, this implies that $\bigcap_{T \in \text{Hom}_{\mathbb{R}}(V, \mathbb{R})} I_{\{T\}}$ is nonempty. Choose a vector v in it. Let $T \in \text{Hom}(V, \mathbb{C})$. As $\text{Re}(T)$ and $\text{Im}(T)$ are in $\text{Hom}_{\mathbb{R}}(V, \mathbb{R})$, we have

$$\begin{aligned} T(v) &= \text{Re}(T(v)) + i \text{Im}(T(v)) \\ &= \int_X \text{Re}(T(f(x)))d\mu(x) + i \int_X \text{Im}(T(f(x)))d\mu(x) \\ &= \int_X T(f(x))d\mu(x), \end{aligned}$$

so $v = \int_X f d\mu$. Also, $v \in K$ because all the $I_{\{T\}}$ are contained in K by definition.

- h) By the Hahn-Banach theorem, there exists $T \in \text{Hom}(V, \mathbb{C})$ such that $T(v) = \|v\|$ and $\|T\|_{op} \leq 1$. Then

$$\|v\| = |T(v)| = \left| \int_X T(f(x))d\mu(x) \right| \leq \int_X |T(f(x))|d\mu(x) \leq \int_X \|f(x)\|d\mu(x).$$

□

3. In this problem, X is a locally compact Hausdorff space and μ is a regular Borel measure on X . Let V be a Banach space, let $f : X \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$ be a function in $L^1(X, \mu)$, and let $G : X \rightarrow V$ be a bounded continuous function.

The goal of this problem is to show that :

- (i) the function $fG : X \rightarrow V$ has an integral v ;
 - (ii) $\|v\| \leq (\sup_{x \in X} \|G(x)\|) (\int_X |f(x)|d\mu(x))$;
 - (iii) $v \in \overline{\text{Span}(G(X))}$.
- a) (1) Show that fG is weakly integrable.
 - b) (1) Let $(f_n)_{n \geq 0}$ be a sequence of functions of $\mathcal{C}_c(X)$ that converges to f in $L^1(X, \mu)$. Show that $\int f_n G d\mu$ exists for each $n \geq 0$, and that $(\int_X f_n G d\mu)_{n \geq 0}$ is a Cauchy sequence.
 - c) (2) Prove assertions (i), (ii) and (iii) above.

Solution.

- a) Let $T \in \text{Hom}(V, \mathbb{C})$. Then, for every $x \in X$,

$$|T(f(x)G(x))| \leq |f(x)| |T(G(x))| \leq |f(x)| \|T\|_{op} \|G(x)\| \leq |f(x)| \|T\|_{op} \sup_{y \in X} \|G(y)\|.$$

As $\sup_{y \in X} \|G(y)\| < +\infty$ and $f \in L^1(X, \mu)$, the function $T \circ (fG)$ is integrable. So fG is weakly integrable.

- b) For every $h \in \mathcal{C}_c(X)$, the function $hG : X \rightarrow V$ is continuous and has support contained in $\text{supp}(h)$, hence compact. By problem 2, this function is integrable, and we have

$$\left\| \int_X (hG)(x) d\mu(x) \right\| \leq \int_X |h(x)| \|G(x)\| d\mu(x) \leq \sup_{y \in X} \|G(y)\| \|h\|_1.$$

Applying this to f_n shows that $f_n G$ is integrable, and applying it to $f_n - f_m$ shows that

$$\left\| \int_X (f_n G) d\mu(x) - \int_X (f_m G) d\mu \right\| \leq \sup_{y \in X} \|G(y)\| \|f_n - f_m\|_1 \xrightarrow{n, m \rightarrow +\infty} 0$$

because $(f_n)_{n \geq 0}$ converges in $L^1(X, \mu)$.

- c) As V is complete, the Cauchy sequence $(\int_X (f_n G) d\mu)$ has a limit in V , that we'll call v . For every $T \in \text{Hom}(V, \mathbb{C})$, we have

$$T(v) = \lim_{n \rightarrow +\infty} T \left(\int_X (f_n G) d\mu \right) = \lim_{n \rightarrow +\infty} \int_X T(f_n(x)G(x)) d\mu(x).$$

As in (a), we have

$$\left\| \int_X T(f_n(x)G(x)) d\mu(x) - \int_X T(f(x)G(x)) d\mu(x) \right\| \leq \sup_{y \in X} \|G(y)\| \|T\|_{op} \|f_n - f\|_1,$$

so this converges to 0 as $n \rightarrow +\infty$, and we get

$$T(v) = \int_X T(f(x)G(x)) d\mu(x).$$

This shows that x is the integral of fG .

Moreover, by problem 2, $\int_X (f_n G) d\mu$ is in the closure of the span $G(X)$ for every $n \geq 0$. As v is the limit of these vectors, it is also in the close of $\text{Span}(G(X))$.

Finally, to show the bound on $\|v\|$, we could use the Hahn-Banach theorem and the property characterising v as in question 2(h), or use the fact that

$$\left\| \int_X (f_n G) d\mu \right\| \leq \int_X |f_n(x)| \|G(x)\| d\mu(x) \leq \sup_{x \in X} \|G(x)\| \|f_n\|_1$$

for every $n \geq 0$ and that this sequence of integrals converges to v .

□

4. Let G be a locally compact group, μ be a left Haar measure on G , and $L^1(G) = L^1(G, \mu)$. Let $f, g \in L^1(G)$.

- a) (1) Show that the function $G \rightarrow L^1(G)$, $y \mapsto f(y)L_y g$ is weakly integrable and has an integral.
b) (2) Show that

$$f * g = \int_G f(y)L_y g d\mu(y).$$

Solution.

- a) Note that the function $G \rightarrow L^1(G)$, $y \mapsto L_y g$ is continuous and that $\sup_{y \in G} \|L_y g\|_1 = \|g\|_1 < +\infty$. So the conclusion follows from problem 3.

b) Let $F = \int_G f(y)L_y g d\mu(y) \in L^1(G)$. By definition of the intergral, for every $h \in L^\infty(G)$, we have

$$\int_G h(x)F(x)d\mu(x) = \int_{G \times G} h(x)f(y)g(y^{-1}x)d\mu(y)d\mu(x) = \int_G h(x)(f * g)(x)d\mu(x).$$

As $L^\infty(G)$ is the continuous dual of $L^1(G)$, we have $f * g = F$ by question 1(a). □

5. Let G be a locally compact group, μ be a left Haar measure on G , and $L^1(G) = L^1(G, \mu)$. Let π be a unitary representation of G on a Hilbert space V , and let $f \in L^1(G)$.

We would like to define a continuous endomorphism $\pi(f)$ of V by setting $\pi(f) = \int_G f(x)\pi(x)d\mu(x)$, but we cannot apply problem 3 because the map $x \mapsto \pi(x)$ is not continuous in general.

So we define $\pi(f)$ as we did in class, but with more details : Let $v \in V$. Then the function $G \rightarrow V$, $x \mapsto \pi(x)(v)$ is continuous, and it is bounded by $\|v\|$ because all the $\pi(x)$ are unitary, so problem 3 implies that $\int_G f(x)\pi(x)(v)dx$ exists, and that its norm is bounded by $\int_G |f(x)|\|\pi(x)(v)\|d\mu(x) = \|f\|_1\|v\|$ (again using the fact that $\pi(x)$ is unitary for every $x \in G$). So we define a map $\pi(f) : V \rightarrow V$ by sending v to $\int_G f(x)\pi(x)(v)d\mu(x)$. It is easy to see that $\pi(f)$ is \mathbb{C} -linear, and we have just seen that $\|\pi(f)(v)\| \leq \|f\|_1\|v\|$ for every $v \in V$, which means that $\pi(f)$ is bounded and that $\|\pi(f)\|_{op} \leq \|f\|_1$.

Let $v, w \in V$. Then $T \mapsto \langle T(v), w \rangle$ is a continuous linear functional on $\text{End}(V)$, and we have

$$\langle \pi(f)(v), w \rangle = \left\langle \int_G f(x)\pi(x)(v)d\mu(x), w \right\rangle.$$

By question 2(b), this is equal to $\int_G f(x)\langle \pi(x)(v), w \rangle d\mu(x)$. Finally, it is easy to see that $\int_G f(x)\pi(x)d\mu(x)$ is linear in f . (If you want to check it rigorously, you can use the continuous linear functionals on $\text{End}(V)$ defined in the previous paragraph, and then it's a straightforward calculation.) Also, we saw above that $\left\| \int_G f(x)\pi(x)d\mu(x) \right\| \leq \|f\|_1$, so the linear map $L^1(G) \rightarrow \text{End}(V)$ is continuous and its operator norm is ≤ 1 .

Unfortunately, the linear functionals $T \mapsto \langle T(v), w \rangle$ do separate points on $\text{End}(V)$, but they don't generate a dense subspace of $\text{Hom}(\text{End}(V), \mathbb{C})$ if V is infinite-dimensional, so the calculation above is not enough to prove that $\pi(f)$ is the integral of the function $G \rightarrow \text{End}(V)$, $x \mapsto \pi(x)$. (In fact, I am not sure whether this is true or not.)

Let's denote the span of the functionals $T \mapsto \langle T(v), w \rangle$, $v, w \in V$ by MC (for "matrix coefficients"). I will try to prove that MC is not dense in $\text{Hom}(\text{End}(V), \mathbb{C})$. Let $\text{End}(V)_c$ be the closure in $\text{End}(V)$ of the space of operators of finite rank.² Then $\text{End}(V)_c \subsetneq \text{End}(V)$ if V is infinite-dimensional (see problem 6 of problem set 5). So, by the Hahn-Banach theorem, we can find a nonzero bounded linear functional Λ on $\text{End}(V)$ such that $\Lambda(\text{End}(V)_c) = 0$. Let's show that Λ cannot be in \overline{MC} .

Choose a Hilbert basis $(e_i)_{i \in I}$. Then I claim that \overline{MC} is exactly the space of Λ of the form $\Lambda(T) = \sum_{i,j \in I} a_{ij} \langle T(e_i), e_j \rangle$ with $a_{ij} \in \mathbb{C}$ and $\sum_{i,j} |a_{ij}|^2 < +\infty$. First, every linear functional of this form is in \overline{MC} , and the space of functionals of this form is closed. So we just need to prove that every functional $T \mapsto \langle T(v), w \rangle$ is of this form. Let $v, w \in V$, and write $v = \sum_{i \in I} a_i e_i$ and $w = \sum_{i \in I} b_i e_i$. We have $\sum_{i \in I} |a_i|^2 < +\infty$ and $\sum_{i \in I} |b_i|^2 < +\infty$, so

$$\sum_{i,j \in I} |a_i b_j|^2 = \left(\sum_{i \in I} |a_i|^2 \right) \left(\sum_{j \in I} |b_j|^2 \right) < +\infty.$$

²This is the space of compact operators, hence the notation.

As $\langle T(v), w \rangle = \sum_{i,j \in I} a_i \bar{b}_j \langle T(e_i), e_j \rangle$, we get the result.

Now suppose that $\Lambda \in \overline{MC}$, and write $\Lambda(T) = \sum_{i,j \in I} a_{ij} \langle T(e_i), e_j \rangle$ as above. For every $i \in I$ and every $j \in J$, we can find $T \in \text{End}(V)$ such that $T(e_{i'}) = 0$ unless $i' = i$, and $T(e_i) = e_j$ (just take T defined by $T(v) = \langle v, e_i \rangle e_j$); then $T \in \text{End}(V)_c$ because $\dim(\text{Im}(T)) = 1$, so $0 = \Lambda(T) = a_{ij}$. This implies that $a_{ij} = 0$ for all $i, j \in I$, which contradicts the fact that $\Lambda \neq 0$.

6. (extra credit) Let V be a normed vector space. A subset A of V is called *totally bounded* if, for every neighborhood U of 0 in V , there is a finite set F such that $A \subset F + U$.
- (1) Show that the convex hull of a finite subset of V is compact.
 - (1) Show that every compact subset of V is totally bounded.
 - (1) If $A \subset V$ is totally bounded, show that \bar{A} is totally bounded.
 - (2) If A is a totally bounded subset of V , show that its convex hull is totally bounded. (Hint : Open balls are convex.)
 - (2) If V is complete and A is totally bounded, show that \bar{A} is compact.
 - (1) If V is complete and $K \subset V$ is compact, show that the closure of the convex hull of K is compact.

Solution.

- Let F be a finite subset of V . Then its convex hull is contained in $\text{Span}(F)$, which is finite-dimensional. In a finite-dimensional vector space, the convex hull of any compact set is compact, so the convex hull of the finite set F is compact.
- Let K be compact subset of V , and let U be a neighborhood of 0 in V . We may assume that U is open. Then $K \subset \bigcup_{x \in K} (x + U)$. As K is compact, there exists a finite subset F of K such that $K \subset \bigcup_{x \in F} (x + U) = F + U$.
- Let $A \subset V$ be a totally bounded subset, and let U be a neighborhood of 0 in V . We may assume that U is an open ball centered at 0 and of positive radius, say c . Let U' be the open ball centered at 0 of radius $c/2$. As A is totally bounded, there exists a finite set F such that $A \subset F + U'$. As F is finite, the set $F + \bar{U}'$ is closed, so it contains \bar{A} . But $U \supset \bar{U}'$, so $\bar{A} \subset F + U$.
- Let U be a neighborhood of 0 in V . Choose a convex open neighborhood U' of 0 (a ball for example) such that $U' + U' \subset U$, and let F be a finite set such that $A \subset F + U'$. Let K be the convex hull of F , then $A \subset K + U'$. As K and U' are convex, so is $K + U'$, so the convex hull of A is contained in $K + U'$. On the other hand, the set K is compact by question (a), hence totally bounded by question (b), so there exists a finite set F' such that $K \subset F' + U'$, hence $K + U' \subset F' + U' + U' \subset F' + U$. So we have found a finite set F' such that the convex hull of A is contained in $F' + U$.
- Write $K = \bar{A}$. For every $x \in V$ and $c > 0$, let $B(x, c)$ be the closed ball of radius c center at x .

Let $(U_i)_{i \in I}$ be a family of open subsets of K such that $K \subset \bigcup_{i \in I} U_i$, and assume that no finite subfamily of $(U_i)_{i \in I}$ covers K . We know that K is totally bounded by question (c). We will construct by induction on n a decreasing sequence $(K_n)_{n \geq 1}$ of nonempty closed subsets of K such that K_n is contained in a ball of radius $1/n$ and K_n cannot be covered by a finite subfamily of $(U_i)_{i \in I}$.

First, as K is totally bounded, there exists a finite set F such that $K \subset F + B(0, 1) = \bigcup_{x \in F} B(x, 1)$. We choose $x \in F$ such that $K \cap B(x, 1)$ is nonempty and cannot be covered by a finite number of the U_i , and take $K_1 = K \cap B(x, 1)$.

Now suppose that we have constructed K_1, \dots, K_n , with $n \geq 1$. Then, as K_n is totally bounded (as a subset of K), there exists a finite set F such that $K_n \subset F + B(0, (n+1)^{-1})$. Again, as K_n cannot be covered by a finite number of the U_i , there must exist $x \in F$ such that $K_n \cap B(x, (n+1)^{-1})$ is nonempty and can also not be covered by a finite number of the U_i , and we take $K_{n+1} = K_n \cap B(x, (n+1)^{-1})$.

Choose $x_n \in K_n$ for every $n \geq 1$. By the condition that K_n is contained in a ball of radius $1/n$, the sequence $(x_n)_{n \geq 0}$ is a Cauchy sequence. As V is complete, $(x_n)_{n \geq 1}$ has a limit, say x . As $x \in K$, there exists $i \in I$ such that U_i . But then $B(x, c) \subset U_i$ for $c > 0$ small enough, so $K_n \subset U_i$ for n big enough, which contradicts the properties of K_n .

- f) By question (d), the convex hull of K is totally bounded, so its closure is compact by question (e). □

7. (extra credit) Let (X, μ) and (Y, ν) be measure spaces, which we will take σ -finite to simplify. ³ Let $p \in (1, +\infty)$. ⁴ Let $\varphi : X \times Y \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$ be a measurable function. We assume that

$$\int_Y \left(\int_X |\varphi(x, y)|^p d\mu(x) \right)^{1/p} d\nu(y) < \infty.$$

- a) (1) Show that the function $\varphi(\cdot, y)$ is in $L^p(X, \mu)$ for almost every $y \in Y$.
b) (2) Let Y' be a measurable subset of Y such that $\nu(Y - Y') = 0$ and $\varphi(\cdot, y) \in L^p(X, \mu)$ for every $y \in Y'$. Show that the function $Y' \rightarrow L^p(X, \mu)$, $y \mapsto \varphi(\cdot, y)$ is weakly integrable.
c) (2) Show that the integral $h \in L^p(X, \mu)$ of the function of (b) exists, and that we have

$$h(x) = \int_{Y'} \varphi(x, y) d\nu(y)$$

for almost all $x \in X$.

- d) (1) Show Minkowski's inequality :

$$\left(\int_X \left| \int_{Y'} \varphi(x, y) d\nu(y) \right|^p d\mu(x) \right)^{1/p} \leq \int_Y \left(\int_X |\varphi(x, y)|^p d\mu(x) \right)^{1/p} d\nu(y).$$

Solution.

- a) The function $y \mapsto \left(\int_X |\varphi(x, y)|^p d\mu(x) \right)^{1/p}$ is integrable by hypothesis, so it must take finite values for almost all $y \in Y$, which means that $\int_X |\varphi(x, y)|^p d\mu(x) < +\infty$ for almost every $y \in Y$.
b) Let $q \in (1, +\infty)$ be such that $\frac{1}{p} + \frac{1}{q} = 1$. We want to check that, for every $f \in L^q(X, \mu)$, the integral $\int_{Y'} \int_X f(x) \varphi(x, y) d\mu(x) d\nu(y)$ converges. Let $f \in L^q(X, \mu)$. By Hölder's inequality, for every $y \in Y'$, $\int_X f(x) \varphi(x, y) d\mu(x)$ converges absolutely, and

$$\int_X |f(x) \varphi(x, y)| d\mu(x) \leq \|f\|_q \|\varphi(\cdot, y)\|_p.$$

As $\int_{Y'} \|\varphi(\cdot, y)\|_p d\nu(y)$ converges by hypothesis, this gives the convergence of $\int_{Y'} \int_X f(x) \varphi(x, y) d\mu(x) d\nu(y)$, and even its absolute convergence.

³There is a way to extend the results to not necessarily σ -compact locally compact groups with their Haar measures.

⁴Minkowski's inequality is still true for $p = 1$, but it follows immediately from the Fubini-Torelli theorem in that case.

- c) We have in question (b) that $\int_X \int_Y |f(x)\varphi(x,y)|d\mu(x)d\nu(y) < +\infty$ for every $f \in L^1(X, \mu)$. By Fubini's theorem, this implies that, for every $f \in L^q(X, \mu)$, $\int_Y |f(x)\varphi(x,y)|d\nu(y) = |f(x)| \int_Y |\varphi(x,y)|d\nu(y) < +\infty$ for almost all $x \in X$. As f is arbitrary (and μ is σ -finite), we get that $\int_Y |\varphi(x,y)|d\nu(y) < +\infty$ for almost all $x \in X$, say for $x \in X'$ with $\mu(X - X') = 0$.

We define a function $h : X' \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$ by $h(x) = \int_Y \varphi(x,y)d\nu(y)$. We want to show that this is the integral of $y \mapsto \varphi(\cdot, y)$. If $f \in L^q(X, \mu)$, we have

$$\int_X f(x)h(x)d\mu(x) = \int_X \int_Y f(x)\varphi(x,y)d\mu(x)d\nu(y),$$

so, using Hölder's inequality as in question (b),

$$\left| \int_X f(x)h(x)d\mu(x) \right| \leq \int_{X \times Y} |f(x)\varphi(x,y)|d\mu(x) \leq C\|f\|_q,$$

where

$$C = \int_Y \left(\int_X |\varphi(x,y)|^p \right)^{1/p} d\nu(y).$$

This shows that $f \mapsto \int_X f(x)h(x)d\mu(x)$ is a bounded linear functional on $L^q(X, \mu)$, and that its operator norm is bounded by C . As the continuous dual of $L^q(X, \mu)$ is $L^p(X, \mu)$, we must have $h \in L^p(X, \mu)$ and $\|h\|_p \leq C$. The first property, together with the formula for $\int_X f(x)h(x)d\mu(x)$, says that h is indeed the integral of $y \mapsto \varphi(\cdot, y)$.

- d) The second property of h proved above is exactly Minkowski's inequality. □